The Nation.

Oct 15, 1905

558

The Nation.

In New York.

by W. A. L. Ray

and others.

at high, but there is nothing melancholy in the beauty, though everything is different from the original. She is a woman in good and loving

was trying to bring the matter out

the larger whole. She is the lady

of the two famous Victorians, the

in the early months of the century,

the evidence of the finest of artists,

the result of a loving and truthful

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

the result of a loving and truthful

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,

she has the courage to tell her

in the early months of the century,
The Nation

[Vol. 83, No. 2156]

as a whole is impopulated, a novelty to the history of science; and still the list is incomplete, and there is no equal disagreement, as to its business of logic. The school to which Mr. Joseph seems to give his allegiance, which is that of theardy of English logicians, is one of those that just mentioned: for it treats itself very little with any questions of method; but just goes on, by setting opinions upon points of logic, and attaching to the one or to the other any reasons that may suggest themselves. Such promiscuous methods of invigoration, in loose to certain doctrines among the disciples of the different names of the school, and it is that some of the adherents—Miss Constant Jones, for example, and Alfred North—have written books of marked originality, which readers who dip into the subject without dreading too deep find very suggestive. The latter, moreover, has shown how the author of these volumes, are led, by what- ever reasons and incapable power it may be, to reproduce in the main the division and form of the traditional logic, slightly modified by metaphysical doctrine, partly in most cases those of Mill, without any immediate contact with those of the philosophers of science, for the simplification some of them attach to the old system of logic; for they have only preserved the shell and have cast away the kernel. For instance, Mr. Joseph omits from his list of general propositions all those which do not apply the existence of some individuals denote- ed by their subject, as well as all those which, while they do, not produce the "universal necessity," both of which express faults firmly confided by the Jotum deo of Aristotle and with all modern, and total, which, taken together, make one simple proposition to express at once both "existence and necessity," which constitute a third branch of traditional usage in connection with the use of the single term "existence." In each case it is a proper agreement with the traditional doctrine by denomi- nations of facts of the existing system of consequences and the duty to logic, but only to begin, the creation of a new system in the place of the, like that of the historical sciences of Mr. Joseph in this manner.

We shall not find fault with any man for any reason studied; and it is given him any particular pleasure to call his study logic, that work by this time pretty near- ly settled. Only we would suggest that the professed aim of logic in the way as above stated, "as if Mr. Joseph and others of his school tell us that logic asserts, "how we think" it seems fair to demand that their conclusions should be based upon in- scriptions correspondingly broad. The re- viewer, for instance, can have nothing but praise for a logic that firmly requires evidence to the solution, which carefully analyzed all those phrases of the German lan- guage that are explicit, exacting, logical, and without any pretense that it covered all the possibilities of thought in this narrow class of conjunctural evidence. We might think, however, that when coming to these varieties of thought, it would be better to begin by persuading all the ways in which we must think in order to draw all sorts of necessary conclusions; for even if logic be concerned with all kinds of thinking, we are inclined in the opinion that it is speakly concerned with those forms of thought to have some bearing upon the possibility or non-possibility of different ways of reasoning. It was fifty-nine years ago that Professor De Morgan called attention to certain forms of inference of great prac- tical importance, which nothing in the logic-books explicated or gave any clue to, although it is necessary to sound reasoning to distinguish the cases in which such arguments are valid from the cases in which they are invalid. Yet we do not remember ever having seen any mention of these forms of inference in any treatise of Mr. Joseph's school. Here is an example of one of them:

Every dollar that ever was or will be in the safe was or will have been received as a loan.
For every dollar ever received as a loan, there is a dollar more.
Every dollar that ever was or will be in the safe was or will have been received as a loan.

When De Morgan opened this road to logical inquiry, he opened a road to some- thing very different for British logic; but unfortunately, investigations of any vigor were lacking. De Morgan did much more than that; for he also opened up the road of relations, which had been the subject of a well-arranged branch of logic, and which, when American and German logicians developed it, turned out to be a wonderful new light upon every aspect of logic, while the logicians of the Oxford school entirely advanced this rea- sons for thinking a logic of relations to be impossible.

The distinguished mathematical geon, George Boole, produced a method of logical inquiry by means of algebras, which was a most brilliant achievement. A few logicians of the most numerous British school have put attention in the British logic. We mention here, not be- cause they are the best, but because they are the most original, Venn, Jevons, and Keynes. The great body seems never to have looked into it.

Pedantry will make that human intelli- gence in under what obligations to the lut- ter of De Morgan, always, President of the London Mathematical So- ciety. But no one may next in rank for anyone who has published any evidence that logicians of the school were speaking of, to have so much as divided what reference his laborious researches have for any real problem of reasoning. It is a matter of regret to see the brevity of this article forces us to confine ourselves to Mr. Joseph's faults, since they are the faults of his school, and it is not quite fair to the individual to judge him exclusively according to the cases in which he beheld. But the truth is that when we have said that this treatise pos- sesses such original merits as the majority of the thousand treatises it claims to have appeared since Michael Scott and the western publications of Aristotle, and per- haps possesses a little more, we have ac- ceded to all the critics it merits; while its school is of more importance not as the account of his numerical greatness, and be- comes the evil that it is working in British thought. This school is composed mostly of his disciples and often alike adding

whom interest in logic lies in the profe- sion, the following, the papularities, or authors, or other sources of bread and but- ter which they carry, and who are there- fore more observant, bound to enjoy any movement in the thought of Eng- lish logic. When a study fails to de- velop definite and well-considered meth- ods; when it is not animated by a sufficient passion to find out the truth, whatever the truth may be, to insure the careful study of all the work that assists students in their studies; and when in place of manifold new discoveries, it does to more than merely reproduce simple facts, it is true to boast that it is a science.

Mr. Joseph sometimes lays down general propositions without any pretense at mak- ing their understandings evident; and he justifies this practice by saying that his book is not a complete treatise on logic, but a mere statement, in which "an instruc- tion in logic." Now, says he, in the first introduction to any science there must be some or less definition. In this strict pedagogical style, however, a man is to write an introduction to any science—say chemistry—he will draw a clear line between informa- tion as to what has happened, and imaginative intuitions upon principles and the like, and will take the simple facts in de- scribing, say, the experiences of Lamarck upon the extinction and reduction of animal, to show the clearness of the con- cept; as to no the idea that there is no any appeal to authority or other arbitrary determination of judgment. If he has to teach botany, he will probably see the beginner at work to draw a figure with his own eye and figures, and to de- scribe what he sees; and will be careful to make himself understand that botany is only an orderly description of what can always be seen under favorable conditions. It appears to some of us, that the first steps in any science ought to be made with the help of an introduction to that science; and we should not approve of an introduction in botany, when, having read a hundred pages occupied with the arti- cles, through indulgence, the botanist, who is only to describe species and other forms. Yet he is the like of that, which Mr. Joseph's logic; and useful as his book may prove to an advanced logician, it is almost the worst possible for a beginner's introduction to the subject.


This anonymous essay is a volume of more than five pages of essays and papers, and is in the form of the elaborate sympo- sium, supplemented by various reports in writing by the dramatic personae, among whom are Augustus G. W. Smith "with a comedian," Martin Trevelyan, in July, Rev. August- ine Claric, an independent editor, Lee- nard Meyer, or artistic editor, William Brown, a London engineer, and a monarch of the Intelligible Department of the New- York, and Tomp de Verne, a retired ed- itor. The Author himself is Mr. A. W. T. L., a writer, a liberal of several

1139

P